

# Minutes



OF A MEETING OF THE

## Planning Committee

HELD AT 6.00PM ON 26 AUGUST 2009

AT COUNCIL OFFICES, CROWMARSH GIFFORD

### Present:

Mr G Andrews, Ms J Bland, Mr D Bretherton, Mr D Dodds (as substitute for Mr I Lokhon), Mr C Daukes (as substitute for Mr F Bloomfield), Capt J Flood, Mrs E Gillespie, Mr A Hodgson, Mrs A Midwinter, Mrs J Murphy (as substitute for Mr P Cross), Mr R Peasgood, Mr R Peirce, Mr A Rooke, Mrs M Turner and Mr M Welply (as substitute for Mrs P Slatter)

### Apology:

Mr F Bloomfield, Mr P Cross, Mr I Lokhon and Mrs P Slatter tendered apologies.

### Officers:

Miss E Bowerman, Mr P Bowers, Mrs S Crawford, Miss P Fox, Mrs H Moore, Mr M Moore, Ms S Oborn, Mr I Price, Miss S Spencer, Mrs J Thompson

### 38. Election of Chairman for this meeting

Both the Chairman and Vice-Chairman were unavoidably absent from this meeting.

**RESOLVED:** to elect Capt J Flood as Chairman for this meeting of the committee.

### 39. Minutes

**RESOLVED:** to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 5 August 2009 as a correct record and to agree that the Chairman sign them.

### 40. P09/W0489 Land to west of Reading Road, Winterbrook, Wallingford

The committee considered an application for planning permission for the demolition of 10 Winterbrook and development of land to the west to provide 106 dwellings with associated new access and landscaping at land to the west of Reading Road, Winterbrook, Wallingford.

The planning officer reported that the house shown as The Lawns on the plan was a listed building. She had received correspondence from: Wallingford Town Council recommending refusal; a 203 signature petition against the development; three

further letters of objection; and one further letter of support. Oxfordshire County Council highways officers recommended a number of conditions should the application be approved.

She recommended amending part of the second refusal reason (last sentence) to read: 'The development would be harmful to the character and distinctiveness of Winterbrook and the surrounding countryside and would detract from the setting of Winterbrook Lodge and Winterbrook House, contrary to PPS1 .....C6 and CON5...'. She also recommended amending part of the third refusal reason to read: 'Central Oxfordshire Area (excluding Didcot)'.

Oxfordshire County Council highways officers Mr D Groves, Ms R Nixey and Mr A Pope attended to speak to and answer questions from the committee.

Mr J Unsworth, Mr A Jones and Mr T Davies of the Save Winterbrook Group, and Mr J Griffin, representing Crowmarsh Parish Council, spoke objecting to the application.

Mrs P Dawe and Mrs F Aska, local ward councillors, spoke objecting to the application.

A motion to refuse the application for the reasons set out in the report, with the amendments recommended by the planning officer, was declared carried on being moved, seconded and put to the vote.

**RESOLVED:** to refuse planning permission for application P09/W0489 land to west of Reading Road, Winterbrook, Wallingford for the following reasons:

Contrary to the Local Plan.

1. That the proposed development is contrary to the policies of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan. This development for 106 dwellings and associated infrastructure is on land outside of the built up area of Winterbrook and in the open countryside. The site is not allocated for development (H2) and it is not infill development (H5). The development would undesirably extend into and encroach upon the open countryside (H6) and detract from the character and landscape setting of Winterbrook (C4).

Lack of comprehensive development across the whole of site E and this scheme does not allow for the protection of the character of Winterbrook

2. The development of this site does not allow for the comprehensive masterplanning or development of the larger site E and consequently fails to provide a high quality design for the site as a whole and does not minimise the adverse effects on the environment. The access and layout proposed does not integrate well with Winterbrook and the

surrounding area and would erode the existing informal character of this area. The application fails to provide good links and permeability, and does not respect the character of the landscape and existing settlement patterns. The development would be harmful to the character and distinctiveness of Winterbrook and the surrounding countryside and would detract from the setting of Winterbrook Lodge and Winterbrook House, contrary to PPS1, PPS3, PPS7 and Policies G2, G4, G6, D1, C1, C4, C6, and CON5 of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan.

The development would undermine the achievement of the Council's policy objectives.

3. There is no housing shortfall in the Central Oxfordshire area (excluding Didcot) and no need to bring sites forward in advance of the core strategy. Planning permission should be granted only where it can be demonstrated that the proposal would not undermine the achievement of the Council's policy objectives. Development of this site at the current time as piecemeal development of Site E would prejudice the proper planning and deliverability of a viable infrastructure package needed to support the development of an urban extension to Wallingford and comes before the proper assessment of potential alternative development opportunities within the Wallingford area. As such the proposal would undermine the creation of a healthy, thriving community, contrary to the strategic objectives of SE Plan policies SP3 and BE1 and policies C01, C02 and C03 which focus growth at Didcot and to contrary to advice in PPS3 and PPS12.

Lack of affordable housing, infrastructure and services  
(these could be overcome subject to the completion of a Section 106 agreement.)

4. That the proposal fails to provide affordable housing in accordance with PPS3 and Policy H9 of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan.

5. That the proposal fails to provide adequate facilities and services to meet the needs of the development contrary to PPS12, policy G3 of the Oxfordshire Structure Plan and Policies C6, R2, R3, R6, D11, D12 of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan.

#### **41. P09/E0595/RET Former Essex House Hotel, 149 Chinnor Road, Thame**

Mr D Dodds and Mrs A Midwinter, local ward councillors, stepped down from the committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

Following a site visit<sup>1</sup>, the committee considered an application for retrospective planning permission for revisions to the elevations of Block B including an increase in the height and alterations to the existing building to provide a bin and cycle store at the former Essex House Hotel, 149 Chinnor Road, Thame.

Mrs B Dobie, representative of Thame Town Council, addressed the committee objecting to the application.

Mr D Phillips, a local resident, addressed the committee, objecting to the application.

Mr D Brotherton, the applicant, addressed the committee in support of the application.

Mr D Dodds and Mrs A Midwinter, local ward councillors, addressed the committee objecting to the application.

A motion, moved and seconded to approve the application, on being put, was declared carried on the casting vote of the Chairman.

**RESOLVED:** to grant retrospective planning permission for application P09/E0595/RET, former Essex House Hotel, 149 Chinnor Road, Thame with the following conditions:

1. Obscure glaze and fix shut specified window to bay window in Block B in accordance with details to be agreed within three months.
2. Retain approved landscaping scheme.
3. Lighting scheme.
4. Retain and maintain parking areas.
5. Cycle and bin storage areas to be agreed in three months and then maintained.
6. Bat scheme to be agreed within three months and then retained.

## **42. P09/E0710 Middle Farm House, Crowell Road, Chinnor**

Mr G Andrews, a local ward councillor, stepped down from the committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The committee considered an application for planning permission for two 2-bedroom and two 3-bedroom dwellings, associated garages, and accesses from Crowell Road and Greenwood Avenue, at Middle Farm, Crowell Road, Chinnor.

The planning officer reported that the conservation officer raised no objections to the application. She had received two additional letters expressing concern about the density of development, the garage arrangement and additional traffic. An objection

---

<sup>1</sup> Minute 35 (meeting of 5 July 2009) refers

had been received from a neighbour directly adjoining the site, concerned about the proximity of the proposed dwelling and the garage. The garage has now been re-sited and the height reduced as shown in the amended plans. She clarified that the access situated within the one way system would continue to serve one property only. The council's drainage consultant had asked for a surface water drainage condition to be imposed.

Mr F Folkard, the applicant, addressed the committee in support of the application.

The committee agreed to alter condition 6 of the officer's report to read 'Access alterations to be undertaken prior to start of construction of any new property'

A motion, moved and seconded to approve the application with amendments to the conditions (above), on being put, was declared carried.

**RESOLVED:** to grant planning permission for application P09/E0710, Middle Farm House Crowell Road, Chinnor subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years.
2. Sample of all materials to be submitted and agreed.
3. No garage conversion into accommodation.
4. Construction and retention of driveway, parking and turning.
5. Tree protection measures to be put in place in accordance with details to be provided.
6. Access alterations to be undertaken prior to start of construction of any new property.
7. Landscaping scheme.
8. Contamination investigation.
9. Sustainability measures to be incorporated.
10. Drainage condition.

#### **43. P09/E0597 & P09/E0598/CA Mapledurham House and estate, Mapledurham**

Mr R Peasgood, a local ward councillor, stepped down from the committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The committee considered applications for planning permission and conservation area consent for a replacement fence, posts and gates with brick wall, iron railing, brick piers and permanent timber gates at Mapledurham House, Mapledurham.

Ms J Bowen, representing Mapledurham Parish Council, spoke objecting to the application.

Mr T Whitaker, local resident, spoke objecting to the application.

Mr M Carlisle, the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

Mr R Peasgood, a local ward councillor, spoke about the application.

A motion, moved and seconded to approve the application, on being put, was declared carried.

**RESOLVED:** to grant planning permission for application P09/E0597 Mapledurham House, Mapledurham with the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years.
2. Sample of materials to be submitted for approval.
3. Flint to be built in traditional panels using lime mortar.
4. Sample panel to show bond, joints and mortar of the brick walls.
5. The use of iron railings.
6. Detailed drawings of the stone finials to be submitted for approval.

And to grant conservation area consent for application P09/E0598/CA with the following conditions:

1. Conservation area consent commencement three years.
2. Contract secured for the rebuilding of the boundary.

The meeting closed at 8.20pm

Chairman